

1 PETER D. KEISLER  
 Assistant Attorney General, Civil Division  
 2 CARL J. NICHOLS  
 Deputy Assistant Attorney General  
 3 DOUGLAS N. LETTER  
 Terrorism Litigation Counsel  
 4 JOSEPH H. HUNT  
 Director, Federal Programs Branch  
 5 ANTHONY J. COPPOLINO  
 Special Litigation Counsel  
 6 ANDREW H. TANNENBAUM  
 ALEXANDER K. HAAS (SBN 220932)  
 7 Trial Attorneys  
 Email: tony.coppolino@usdoj.gov  
 8 U.S. Department of Justice  
 Civil Division, Federal Programs Branch  
 9 20 Massachusetts Avenue, NW, Rm. 6102  
 Washington, D.C. 20001  
 10 Phone: (202) 514-4782  
 Fax: (202) 616-8460

11 *Attorneys for Federal Defendants Sued in their Official Capacities*  
 12 *and the Federal Intervenor-Defendants (United States of America,*  
 13 *National Security Agency, President George W. Bush)*

14 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
 15 NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA  
 16 SAN FRANCISCO DIVISION

17 IN RE NATIONAL SECURITY ) **No. M:06-cv-01791-VRW**  
 AGENCY TELECOMMUNICATIONS )  
 18 RECORDS LITIGATION )

19 This Document Relates To:

20 (1) All Actions Against the MCI and )  
 Verizon Defendants in the Master MCI )  
 21 and Verizon Consolidated Complaint, )  
 Dkt. 125; (2) *Chulsky* (MDL 06-06570) )

22 except:

23 (3) *Bready* (MDL 06-06313) )  
 24

) **STIPULATION PERMITTING THE UNITED**  
 ) **STATES TO INTERVENE; AND ~~PROPOSED~~**  
 ) **ORDER**

25 Judge: Hon. Vaughn R. Walker

26 Date: June 21, 2007

**RECITALS**

A. On January 16, 2007, pursuant to this Court's case management order, the plaintiffs in suits against the Verizon and MCI defendants filed a Master Complaint [Dkt. 125]. In addition, there are several other cases against Verizon defendants not covered by the Master Complaint, such as *Riordan* (MDL 06-3574); *Bready* (MDL 06-06313); and *Chulsky* (MDL 06-06570).

B. This Court entered an Order [Dkt. 217] giving the United States until April 20, 2007, to file a "motion to dismiss or, in the alternative, for summary judgment and any assertion of the state secrets privilege" in the MCI and Verizon cases.

C. The United States intends to assert the state secrets privilege in each of these cases, and seeks intervention in order to seek the dismissal of these cases.

D. The United States requested the stipulation of all plaintiffs in the MCI and Verizon cases where the United States had not yet intervened,<sup>1</sup> as well as the stipulation of MCI's counsel and Verizon's counsel. With the exception of the *Bready* and *Riordan* plaintiffs, all MCI and Verizon parties have stipulated to the intervention of the United States. The United States' intervention in *Bready* is dealt with in a separate motion filed concurrently herewith.

**STIPULATION**

The MCI and Verizon Plaintiffs, with the exception of those in *Bready* and *Riordan*, counsel for MCI defendants and counsel for Verizon defendants, and the United States, through their attorneys of record, hereby stipulate and request that the Court make this stipulation an order of the Court:

1. The United States shall be permitted to intervene in the above-referenced actions as a Defendant pursuant to Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 24.

---

<sup>1</sup> The United States moved to intervene in the *Riordan* case in August 2006, and that motion to intervene was granted on March 29, 2007, *see Riordan*, 05-cv-3574, Dkt. 64 (Mar. 29, 2007).

1 DATED: April 20, 2007

Respectfully Submitted,

2  
3 PETER D. KEISLER  
Assistant Attorney General, Civil Division  
4 CARL J. NICHOLS  
Deputy Assistant Attorney General  
5 DOUGLAS N. LETTER  
Terrorism Litigation Counsel  
6 JOSEPH H. HUNT  
Director, Federal Programs Branch  
7 ANTHONY J. COPPOLINO  
Special Litigation Counsel  
8 ANDREW H. TANNENBAUM  
ALEXANDER K. HAAS (SBN 220932)  
9 Trial Attorneys  
U.S. Department of Justice  
10 Civil Division, Federal Programs Branch  
20 Massachusetts Avenue, NW  
11 Washington, D.C. 20001  
Phone: (202) 514-4782 — Fax: (202) 616-8460  
12 Email: [tony.coppolino@usdoj.gov](mailto:tony.coppolino@usdoj.gov)

13  
14 By: /s/ Alexander K. Haas  
Alexander K. Haas

15  
16 Attorneys for United States of America, National Security  
Agency, President George W. Bush

17 Elizabeth J. Cabraser (State Bar No. 083151)  
Barry R. Himmelstein (State Bar No. 157736)  
18 Michael W. Sobol (State Bar No. 194857)  
Eric B. Fastiff (State Bar No. 182260)  
19 Allison S. Elgart (State Bar No. 241901)  
LIEFF, CABRASER, HEIMANN & BERNSTEIN, LLP  
20 275 Battery Street, 30th Floor  
San Francisco, CA 94111-3339  
21 Telephone: (415) 956-1000  
22 Facsimile: (415) 956-1008

23  
24 By: /s/ Barry R. Himmelstein

25 Barry R. Himmelstein  
Interim Class Counsel for MCI Class  
26  
27  
28

Ronald L. Motley  
Jodi W. Flowers  
Don Migliori  
Vincent Parrett (State Bar No. 237563)  
MOTLEY RICE, LLC  
28 Bridgeside Boulevard  
P.O. Box 1792  
Mount Pleasant, SC 29465  
Telephone: (843) 216-9000  
Facsimile: (843) 216-9027

By: /s/ Jodi W. Flowers

Jodi W. Flowers  
Interim Class Counsel for Verizon Class

SHAPIRO & STERNLIEB, LLC  
DAVID H. STERNLIEB  
800 Tennent Rd.  
Manalapan, NJ 07726  
(732) 617-8050

By: /s/ David H. Sternlieb

David H. Sternlieb  
Attorney for Chulsky Plaintiffs

WILMER, CUTLER, PICKERING, HALE & DORR LLP  
JOHN A. ROGOVIN  
RANDOLPH D. MOSS  
SAMIR C. JAIN  
BRIAN BOYNTON  
BENJAMIN C. MIZER  
1875 Pennsylvania Ave, NW  
Washington, DC 20006  
202-663-6083  
Fax: 202-663-6363

By: /s/ John Rogovin

John Rogovin  
Attorneys for the MCI Defendants and Verizon Defendants

**DECLARATION PURSUANT TO GENERAL ORDER 45, § X.B**

I, ALEXANDER K. HAAS, hereby declare pursuant to General Order 45, § X.B, that I have obtained the concurrence in the filing of this document from each of the other signatories listed above and below.

I declare under penalty of perjury that the foregoing declaration is true and correct.

Executed on April 20, 2007, in the City of Washington, District of Columbia.

PETER D. KEISLER  
Assistant Attorney General, Civil Division  
CARL J. NICHOLS  
Deputy Assistant Attorney General  
DOUGLAS N. LETTER  
Terrorism Litigation Counsel  
JOSEPH H. HUNT  
Director, Federal Programs Branch  
ANTHONY J. COPPOLINO  
Special Litigation Counsel  
ANDREW H. TANNENBAUM  
ALEXANDER K. HAAS (SBN 220932)  
Trial Attorneys  
U.S. Department of Justice  
Civil Division, Federal Programs Branch  
20 Massachusetts Avenue, NW  
Washington, D.C. 20001  
Phone: (202) 514-4782 — Fax: (202) 616-8460  
Email: [tony.coppolino@usdoj.gov](mailto:tony.coppolino@usdoj.gov)

By: /s/ Alexander K. Haas  
Alexander K. Haas

Attorneys for United States of America, National Security  
Agency, President George W. Bush

1 Elizabeth J. Cabraser (State Bar No. 083151)  
2 Barry R. Himmelstein (State Bar No. 157736)  
3 Michael W. Sobol (State Bar No. 194857)  
4 Eric B. Fastiff (State Bar No. 182260)  
5 Allison S. Elgart (State Bar No. 241901)  
6 LIEFF, CABRASER, HEIMANN & BERNSTEIN, LLP  
7 275 Battery Street, 30th Floor  
8 San Francisco, CA 94111-3339  
9 Telephone: (415) 956-1000  
10 Facsimile: (415) 956-1008

11 By: /s/ Barry R. Himmelstein per G.O. 45

12 Barry R. Himmelstein  
13 Interim Class Counsel for MCI Class

14 Ronald L. Motley  
15 Jodi W. Flowers  
16 Don Migliori  
17 Vincent Parrett (State Bar No. 237563)  
18 MOTLEY RICE, LLC  
19 28 Bridgeside Boulevard  
20 P.O. Box 1792  
21 Mount Pleasant, SC 29465  
22 Telephone: (843) 216-9000  
23 Facsimile: (843) 216-9027

24 By: /s/ Jodi W. Flowers per G.O. 45

25 Jodi W. Flowers  
26 Interim Class Counsel for Verizon Class

27 SHAPIRO & STERNLIEB, LLC  
28 DAVID H. STERNLIEB  
800 Tennent Rd.  
Manalapan, NJ 07726  
(732) 617-8050

By: /s/ David H. Sternlieb per G.O. 45

David H. Sternlieb  
Attorney for Chulsky Plaintiffs

1 WILMER, CUTLER, PICKERING, HALE & DORR LLP  
2 JOHN A. ROGOVIN  
3 RANDOLPH D. MOSS  
4 SAMIR C. JAIN  
5 BRIAN BOYNTON  
6 BENJAMIN C. MIZER  
7 1875 Pennsylvania Ave, NW  
8 Washington, DC 20006  
9 202-663-6083  
10 Fax: 202-663-6363

11 By: /s/ John Rogovin per G.O. 45

12 John Rogovin  
13 Attorneys for the MCI Defendants and Verizon Defendants  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28

~~PROPOSED~~ ORDER

Having considered the above stipulation to permit intervention by the United States pursuant to Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 24, the United States is allowed to intervene in the actions covered by the stipulation as a defendant.

IT IS SO ORDERED.

Dated: April <sup>24</sup> \_\_, 2007

